

**BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS
AND
DURHAM CITY COUNCIL**

DURHAM, NORTH CAROLINA

Wednesday September 19, 2007

5:10 P.M. Special Session

MINUTES

Place: Commissioners' Room, second floor, Durham County Government Administrative Complex, 200 E. Main Street, Durham, NC

Present: County Commissioners: Chairman Ellen W. Reckhow, Vice-Chairman Becky M. Heron, and Commissioners Philip R. Cousin Jr. and Michael D. Page

City Council: Mayor William V. "Bill" Bell, Mayor Pro Tempore Cora Cole-McFadden, and Council Members Eugene A. Brown, Thomas Stith III, and J. Michael Woodard

Absent: Commissioner Lewis A. Cheek and City Council Members Diane N. Catotti and Howard Clement III

Presider: Chairman Reckhow

Call to Order and Introduction

County Commission Chairman Ellen Reckhow called the meeting to order. She stated that the purpose of today's joint meeting is to discuss the Greenhouse Gas and Criteria Air Pollutant Emissions Inventory and Local Action Plan for Emission Reductions. Chairman Reckhow announced that a steering committee was formed and that she and Council Member Woodard represented their two governing boards on the committee. "This has been a great process." Chairman Reckhow turned the meeting over to Ellen Beckmann to provide background.

Greenhouse Gas and Criteria Air Pollutant Emissions Inventory and Local Action Plan for Emission Reductions

Ellen Beckmann, Transportation Planner, DCHC MPO/City of Durham, noted the attachments that had been passed out. She stated that the Greenhouse Gas Plan is to demonstrate Durham's commitment to climate protection, energy efficiency, and environmental sustainability. She provided a brief introduction about the process, highlighting the following:

Durham Greenhouse Gas Plan

- Steering Committees:

- Advisory Committee
- Technical Team
- Consultant:
 - ICLEI Energy Services, Toronto, Canada
- March 2006 – September 2007
- Public Input
 - Public Forum – June 21, 2007
 - Survey – Summer 2007
- Website—www.durhamnc.gov/ghg

Ms. Beckmann introduced Dr. Rob Jackson, Nicholas Chair of Global Environmental Change and Professor in the Biology Department and the Nicholas School at Duke University, to give a brief presentation regarding the science of climate change.

Motions to Excuse

Chairman Reckhow commented that a motion was needed from a County Commissioner to excuse Commissioner Cheek from the meeting.

Vice-Chairman Heron moved, seconded by Commissioner Cousin, to excuse Commissioner Cheek from the meeting.

The motion carried with the following vote:

Ayes: Cousin, Heron, Page, and Reckhow
Noes: None
Absent: Cheek

Commissioner Page announced that he must leave early from the meeting because of prior commitments on Wednesday nights; however, he expressed that this is a very important issue.

Mayor Pro Tempore Cole-McFadden stated that a motion was needed from a Council Member to excuse Council Members Catotti and Clement.

Mayor Pro Tempore Cole-McFadden moved, seconded by Council Member Woodard, to excuse Council Members Catotti and Clement.

The motion carried with the following vote:

Ayes: Bell, Cole-McFadden, Stith, and Woodard
Noes: None
Absent: Catotti and Clement
Brown (absent at time of vote)

Greenhouse Gas and Criteria Air Pollutant Emissions Inventory and Local Action Plan for Emission Reductions (continued)

Chairman Reckhow stated that Dr. Jackson presented a great overview at a community forum at City Hall earlier this year. He was invited to this meeting to give an overview as to the science and the solutions.

Dr. Jackson explained briefly why a strong consensus exists in the scientific community that climate change is real, gave two examples (one local and one international) about consequences, and articulated solutions that can be undertaken (particularly as they relate to the Greenhouse Gas Plan, which he strongly endorsed). Dr. Jackson highlighted the following:

The Greenhouse Effect

A brief history of greenhouse gases and global warming:

- 1827—Jean Baptiste Fourier first describes how the atmosphere traps infrared radiation, using a greenhouse as his analogy.
- 1890s—Svante Arrhenius (won 1903 Nobel Prize in Chemistry) and P.C. Chamberlain independently propose that a build-up of greenhouse gases from fossil fuel burning would further warm the earth.
- 1958—Charles David Keeling begins his measurements at Mauna Loa showing a steady increase in atmospheric CO₂.

Recent reports conclude that increased greenhouse gas concentrations are warming the earth—

- “Greenhouse gases are accumulating in Earth’s atmosphere as a result of human activities, causing surface air temperatures and subsurface ocean temperatures to rise.” National Academy of Sciences, 2001
- “Warming of the climate system is unequivocal, as is now evident from observations of increases in global average air and ocean temperatures, widespread melting of snow and ice, and rising global average sea level.” Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, 2007 synthesis, >2,000 scientists
- “Because human activities are contributing to climate change, we have a collective responsibility to develop and undertake carefully considered response actions.” American Meteorological Society, Official statement, >11,000 meteorologists, 2003
- “Scientific evidence strongly indicates that natural influences cannot explain the rapid increase in global near-surface temperatures observed during the second half of the 20th century.” American Geophysical Union, >42,000 Earth scientists, Official climate change statement, 2005

Arctic Sea Ice observed in September 1979 and again in September 2005

Vehicle Emission Reductions (federal policy):

1908 Ford Model T (~20 mpg)

Today—2005 U.S. fleet average (~20 mpg)

“Tomorrow” is here—Hybrid Technology, Diesel (50 mpg)

Cut U.S. fossil fuel emissions by 1/6 with existing technology: 0.25 PgC/yr

Tackling Global Warming Will Improve Air Quality (regional policy):

- In the U.S., coal-fired power plants and car exhaust are the two biggest sources of the “big six”: ozone, particulates, carbon monoxide, nitrogen oxides, sulfur dioxides, and lead.
- During the 2003 blackout in the northeast, visibility improved by 25 miles. Smog and ozone pollution dropped by half within a day, and gases contributing to haze and acid rain plummeted 90%.

Durham’s Opportunity:

- Building Efficiency
- Waste Management
- City Planning
- Fleet Vehicles
- Lighting

Dr. Jackson concluded his presentation by urging that Durham officials take a positive step in the community by adopting the Greenhouse Gas Plan.

Chairman Reckhow asked if anyone had questions of Dr. Jackson.

No one posed questions.

Chairman Reckhow thanked Dr. Jackson for the “great” presentation. She then recognized Ms. Beckmann to provide an overview of the Plan.

Ms. Beckmann highlighted the following:

Durham’s Commitment to the Environment

ICLEI’s Mission:

To build and serve a worldwide movement of local governments dedicated to achieving tangible improvements in global environmental conditions through cumulative local actions.

CCP Mission Statement:

“The mission is to build a worldwide movement of local governments who adopt policies and implement measures that achieve measurable reductions in local greenhouse gas emissions; improve air quality; and enhance urban livability and sustainability.”

CCP Participants:

- More than 800 local government participants worldwide, (165+ in the U.S.) including:
 - Local: Orange County, Chapel Hill, Carrboro, Raleigh (New! August 2007)
 - Large Cities: New York City, Chicago, Los Angeles
 - Southeastern Cities: Atlanta, Miami, Charleston SC
 - International Cities: Toronto, Canada and London, England

Strategic Approach:

ICLEI uses the performance-oriented framework and methodology of the CCP Campaign's 5 Milestones to assist local governments in developing and implementing local approaches

for reducing global warming and air pollution emissions, with the additional benefit of improving community livability.

5 Milestones of CCP:

1. Create an Emissions Inventory and Forecast
2. Establish an Emissions Reduction Target
3. Local Action Plan Approval
4. Implement Measures
5. Monitoring and Verification

The Results:

- The CCP Campaign participants have implemented thousands of mitigation projects and made operational and policy changes that are altering the way cities use energy.
- In North America, 290 participants with a population of 73.6 million have annual emissions reductions of 27.5 million Tons of eCO₂. (ICLEI International Progress Report-CCP -2006)

Economic and Environmental Benefits of Acting Locally:

- Improved air quality
- Improved public health
- Reduction in traffic congestion
- Reduction in government operating costs
- Local economic development
- Local job creation
- Better quality of life

Durham Greenhouse Gas Plan:

Baseline Year = 2005

Target Year = 2030

6 Local Government Sectors:

- Buildings
- Vehicle Fleets
- Water and Sewage
- Streetlights and Traffic Lights
- Solid Waste from Municipal Operations
- Schools

Local Government Inventory:

- Schools - 35%
- Buildings - 27%
- Water/Sewage - 21%
- Vehicle Fleet - 10%
- Streetlights - 7%

Durham's Local Government total GHG Emissions for 2005 were 158,710 tons.

5 Community Sectors:

- Residential
- Commercial/Institutional
- Industrial
- Transportation
- Community Solid Waste

Community Inventory:

- Transportation - 39%
- Commercial - 31%
- Residential - 18%
- Industrial - 12%

Total Community Emissions in 2005 for Durham were 6,837,430 tons of GHGs.

Local Government 2030 Forecast:

2005 - 158,710

2030 Forecast - 167,040 (+5%)

GHGs (t)

Community 2030 Forecast:

2005 - 6,837,430

2030 Forecast - 10,084,260 (+48%)

GHGs (t)

Local Government Operations Target:

2005 Baseline - 158,710

2030 Forecast - 167,040

Low - 97,640 (-38%)

Medium - 77,290 (-51%)

High - 44,210 (-72%)

GHGs (t)

Proposed Local Government Operations Target:

Reduce emissions 50% by 2030

Local Government Reduction Measures:

Buildings—Adopt energy efficiency policies for building upgrades and new construction

Vehicle Fleet—Use more alternative fuels in vehicles

Lighting—Use more energy efficient outdoor lighting

Water & Sewage—Use more energy efficient pumps and processes

Schools—Increase energy efficiency and alternative fuel programs

Solid Waste—Increase recycling

Community Target:

2005 Baseline - 6,837,430

2030 Forecast - 10,084,260 (+48%)

Low - 9,614,917 (+41%)

Medium - 9,124,117 (+33%)
 High - 8,147,997 (+19%)
 GHGs (t)

Population:
 2005: 241,472
 2030: 328,573
 = +36%

Vehicle Miles Traveled:
 2005: 3.2 Billion
 2030: 5.3 Billion
 = +63%

Community Forecasts Per Capita:
 2005 Baseline – 28.2
 2030 Forecast – 30.7
 Low – 29.2
 Medium – 27.8
 High – 24.8
 (GHG Emissions Per Capita [tons])

Speculative Community Forecast:
 2005 Baseline - 6,837,430
 2030 Forecast - 10,084,260 (+47%)
 High - 8,147,997 (+19%)
 High + State Actions - 5,234,474 (-23%)
 High + State Actions + Federal Actions - 4,749,784 (-31%)
 GHGs (t)

Proposed Community Target: Reduce emissions 30% by 2030 through local, state, and federal action.

Community Reduction Measures:
 Residential—Encourage renewable energy use
 Commercial—Encourage energy efficiency for new construction
 Industrial—Encourage the use of energy efficient processes and equipment
 Transportation—Improve transit service and build more bicycle and pedestrian facilities to encourage alternative transportation
 Solid Waste—Implement organics recycling

What Others Are Doing:

City	Baseline Year	Target Year	Target Reduction
Portland, Oregon	1990	2010	10%
San Francisco	1990	2012	20%
London, England	1990	2025	60%
Seattle	1990	2012	7-40%
Melbourne, Australia	1996	2010/2020	50%/100%
Berlin, Germany	2004	2010	25%

Toronto, Canada	2004		20%
New York City	2005	2030	30%
Durham	2005	2030	30%

Implementation:

Recommended Staff Resources:

- City-County “Green Team”
- City-County Sustainability Coordinator

Recommended Education and Outreach:

- Workshops and trainings
- Support community programs and organizations

Recommended Policies and Programs:

- Review programs and services for sustainability principles
- Create new policies and programs
 - Energy Savings Performance Contracting

Recommended Monitoring of Progress:

- Annual reporting of progress
- Update the emissions inventory, forecast, and local action plan every 5 years

Plan Adoption:

Adoption of the inventory, forecast, targets, and local action plan to accomplish Milestones 1, 2, and 3 of the CCP program.

Ms. Beckmann concluded her remarks by requesting that the City and the County adopt the Plan, which would be presented to the MPO (Metropolitan Planning Organization) at a later date.

Chairman Reckhow thanked Ms. Beckmann for the presentation.

At the request of Vice-Chairman Heron, Ms. Beckmann spoke to the value of trees in the community.

Commissioner Cousin asked County Attorney Chuck Kitchen to speak to whether mandates regarding the construction of buildings were an option.

Attorney Kitchen stated that he could not answer the question directly because it was too broad.

Chairman Reckhow explained that the County has a fair amount of latitude relating to site development, but less latitude relating to building codes because the State’s building code sets many of those parameters. A local act is needed to add extra requirements. Some communities have begun giving incentives for “green” construction.

Vice-Chairman Heron and Chairman Reckhow spoke briefly about the construction of “green” houses.

Chairman Reckhow stated that the Homebuilders Association of Durham, Orange, and Chatham Counties has adopted a Green Building Program; the National Association of Homebuilders is developing a national program.

Per a question posed by Council Member Brown, Dr. Jackson spoke about other cities across the country and the State that are addressing the emissions reduction issue.

Ms. Beckmann stated that if the Greenhouse Gas Plan is adopted, then Durham would be the first city in North Carolina to adopt such a plan.

Mayor Pro Tempore Cole-McFadden asked when the vote would be taken.

Chairman Reckhow replied that prior to calling for the vote, she wished to ask one question. She stated that, in addition, a citizen has signed up to speak to the item.

Chairman Reckhow asked Ms. Beckmann if the technical team has considered ways to begin retrofitting county, city, and school buildings to save money on energy costs.

Ms. Beckmann referred the question to Mike Turner, General Services Director.

Mr. Turner replied that discussions have begun; however, further discussions needs to take place.

Chairman Reckhow requested that discussions occur in the near future. Durham Public Schools has informed principals that energy savings at their school buildings could be used for education in their schools. The Plan is not only positive for the environment, but money can be saved in retrofitting and becoming more energy efficient.

Chairman Reckhow called citizens forward who wished to speak.

Each of the following citizens spoke in support of the Plan:

Pat Carstensen, 58 Newton Drive, Durham 27707, representing the Sierra Club, expressed concern about the transportation plan and the inefficient transportation growth south of South Point Mall. The Sierra Club requested adoption of the Plan.

Fred Broadwell, resident of the Northgate Park neighborhood, thanked the City Council and the County Commissioners for their leadership on the Greenhouse Gas Plan. He urged that the Plan be approved and that the recommendations be vigorously implemented, especially the recommendation that a City-County sustainability coordinator be hired.

James Vaughan, 3206 Cole Mill Road, Durham 27712, Chairman of the Durham Cable TV Advisory Board, asked if utilization of Durham’s PEG Access Channels had been considered for advertising the Plan.

Ms. Beckmann stated that the details regarding education and outreach have not been specifically addressed, but Mr. Vaughan's suggestion would be considered.

Marc Dreyfors, representing the Forest Foundation, Carolina Biodiesel, and Greenway Transit, spoke about the value of efforts to mitigate carbon dioxide. School students are exposed to high levels of pollutants from diesel fuel. If school buses could be operated on biodiesel, then exposure would be reduced; the result would be fewer cases of asthma and better work performance within the classroom. He wished to make available to the County Commissioners, the City Council, and Durham's citizens the opportunities from organizations that he represents.

Blair Kendall, 1104 Iredell Street, Durham 27705, Southern Energy Management, spoke to how the plan will promote economic development in Durham. He thanked the Commissioners and City Council for considering the plan, which he applauded.

Nate Udofia, representing Green Durham, reiterated the workforce and economic development aspects of the "green" initiative.

Chairman Reckhow expressed appreciation to the citizens for their comments.

Mayor Bell applauded the work that has been done on the Plan. He stated his opinion that the Plan should be adopted. "This is a wave that the country is moving in; if any city has an opportunity to be at the head, Durham has been." If the Plan can succeed anywhere, it certainly can succeed in Durham. Mayor Bell asked if discussions have taken place regarding whether the sustainability coordinator will report to the City Manager or County Manager.

Chairman Reckhow informed Mayor Bell that the position has been upgraded to sustainability manager. She asked County Manager Ruffin to respond to Mayor Bell.

County Manager Ruffin replied that the City is taking the lead on the "gang" position; therefore, the County has agreed to take the lead on the sustainability manager. Mr. Ruffin stated that a tentative recruitment timeline has been established. An interlocal agreement has been prepared for both governing bodies to review. The City's budget is \$50,000; the County's budget is \$50,000. The money is in place; the framework is laid out. Both Managers have agreed and are ready to proceed.

Council Member Woodard thanked various persons who had spent much time and energy on the Plan—Ms. Beckmann and other staff members, the team from ICLEI, the steering committee which included Chairman Reckhow, and the other advisory committee members who serve the elected boards. "As a community, Durham has proven itself to be a leader in dealing with environmental issues; both City and County governments have been at the front of those efforts. We as a community and as governmental entities have more work to do. The Plan sets forth ambitious goals, which encourages us to aim high. I am also encouraged by the strong support I've seen and heard for this Plan since its release a couple of months back. I know our citizen committees and commissions, as well as our respective staffs, stand ready to begin work. These two elected boards, as we just heard from Manager Ruffin, have already committed funds to establish the new position of the city-county sustainability

manager. The next step is before us tonight. I would strongly urge us to adopt this Plan enthusiastically. The steps after that are up to all of us, government and private sector, to ensure that this isn't just a plan that sits on our shelves and collects dust.

So Madame Chairman, at the appropriate time, I am prepared to make the motion that we adopt the Plan as presented."

Council Member Stith stated that much has been heard about reaping economic benefits from the Plan. He asked if any modeling has been done for our two governing bodies.

Chairman Reckhow responded that Council Member Stith's question relates to her question about whether the technical team has begun to access what can be initiated and how much might be achieved in terms of reductions and savings. That next step has not been taken but will be worked on. The recommendation is that the "green team" (a City-County team of appropriate personnel) continue to meet and work. Chairman Reckhow suggested that the City and County Managers make this next step a priority in terms of the workplan. The sustainability manager will not be able to accomplish this work by himself/herself; support must be given from all entities. Communities that have made progress have integrated sustainability across their operations; their policies and practices are addressing the issues. "What we are going to need is that type of strong leadership. We, in our capacity as elected officials, can set that tone in the workplans for our managers.

Mr. Stith asked that as the process is developed, reporting be given on economic savings for the governing entities projected outward.

Per a question by Mr. Stith, City Manager Baker stated that at the last Joint City-County Committee meeting, he distributed a handout from a particular energy savings company. He mentioned that he was not advocating for this particular company; he was introducing energy savings contracting as something the Committee may choose to consider. The contractor is paid a portion of the energy savings from the implementation of various projects. The Durham Public Schools system has three contractors working on the sustainability of its buildings. Other local governments have done this as well. City Manager Baker recommended that the City move forward with hiring an energy savings contractor. City Council would be advised specifically as the process moves forward.

Mayor Pro Tempore Cole-McFadden stated that she was ready to offer a second to the motion made by Council Member Woodard.

Mayor Bell stated that the motion has been properly moved and seconded that the Plan be adopted as presented. He called for questions. No one responded. He then called for the vote on the motion.

The motion carried with the following vote:

Ayes: Bell, Brown, Cole-McFadden, Stith, and Woodard
Noes: None
Absent: Catotti and Clement

Chairman Reckhow entertained a motion from the Board of County Commissioners.

Vice-Chairman Heron moved, seconded by Commissioner Cousin, to adopt the Greenhouse Gas and Criteria Air Pollutant Emissions Inventory and Local Action Plan for Emission Reductions; develop a budget and a breakdown of the budget; and bring it back to the Commission.

The motion carried with the following vote:

Ayes: Cousin, Heron, Page, and Reckhow
Noes: None
Absent: Cheek

Chairman Reckhow thanked everyone. She stated that an important step has been made, but it is a first step. It is great that Durham is the first in the state to adopt a plan. She expected that the Managers will report, as suggested by Council Member Stith, on next operational steps—the hiring of the sustainability manager, looking at the performance audit for our facilities, and composition of the Green Team and what its charge would be.

Chairman Reckhow acknowledged members of the Environmental Affairs Board and the Open Space and Trails Commission who were in attendance.

Chairman Reckhow encouraged commissions that are interested in environmental issues to look at the recommendations and provide feedback on ideas regarding implementation and how to proceed.

Chairman Reckhow asked Dr. Jackson to consider asking staff from the new institute at the Nicholas School to provide resources.

Adjournment

Chairman Reckhow declared the meeting adjourned at 6:33 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Vonda C. Sessoms
Clerk to the Board